Appendix A Note on Phrasal Comparatives*

Sigrid Beck

Vera Hohaus

Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen

Sonja Tiemann Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen

Contents

1	Con	textual [Degree (Com	para	ative	S											2
	1.1	Japane	se															2
	1.2	English	ı															3
	1.3	Germa	n															4
	1.4	Sāmoa	n											•	•			5
2	Con	positio	nally Int	egra	ted	Stan	dar	ds										6
	2.1	Immob	ile Comp	oarat	ive (Oper	ator	S										6
		2.1.1	Greek															6
		2.1.2	Yorùbá															7
	2.2	Versati	le Phrasa	1 C o	mpa	rativ	e O	pei	ato	ors								8
		2.2.1	Greek .															
		2.2.2	Hindi .															9
		2.2.3	Turkish															10
	2.3	Clausa	l Compai	ative	e Op	erato	ors											1.1
		2.3.1	German															1.1
		2.3.2	English															12
		2.3.3	Greek .															13

Abbreviations used in glosses include: ABL. = ablative case marking; ACC. = accusative case marking; CL = classifier; DAT. = dative case marking; DIR. = directional particle; ERG. = ergative case marking; fem. = feminine; GEN. = genitive case marking; neg. = negation marking; masc. = masculine; NOM. = nominative case marking; pl. = plural; PREP. = preposition; sg. = singular; SUBJUNCT. = subjunctive particle; past = past tense; PERF. = perfective; POSS. = possession relation; STD = standard marker; TAP = tense-aspect marker; and TOP. = marker of topicalization.

 $[\]ast$ We are deeply indebted to all the native speakers who contributed to this project.

1 Contextual Degree Comparatives

	Variation in Acceptability	Variation in Interpretation	Island Sensitivity	Filled Degree Slot			
Japanese [yori]	Yes.	Yes.	-not elicited-	Yes.			
English [compared to]	Yes.	Yes	No.	Yes.			
German [im Vergleich zu]	Yes.	Yes.	No.	Yes.			

Figure 1 Contextual Degree Comparatives

1.1 Japanese

Variation in Acceptability

- (1) ?/??/*Taroo-wa Hanako-ga katta yori nagai kasa-o katta.

 Taroo-TOP. Hanako-TOP. bought STD long umbrella-ACC. bought 'Compared to what Hanako bought, Taroo bought a longer umbrella.'

 (Beck, Oda & Sugisaki 2004: 290)
- (2) Taroo-wa Hanako-ga katta yori takusan kasa-o katta. Taroo-TOP. Hanako-TOP. bought STD many umbrella-ACC. bought 'Compared to what Hanako bought, Taroo bought more umbrellas.' (Beck et al. 2004: 290)

Variation in Interpretation

- (3) <u>Context</u>: Women's clothing is on sale. A \$500 coat is now available for \$250, and a \$150 dress is now available \$130.
- (4) Kooto-wa doresu yori yasui. coat-TOP. dress STD cheap 'Compared to the coat, the dress is cheaper.' (Oda 2008: 56-57)

Filled Degree Argument Slot

(5) John-wa Mary-ga ronbun-o san-bon yonda yori ookuno John-TOP. Mary-NOM. paper-ACC. three-CL read STD many ronbun-o yonda.
paper-ACC. read
'Compared to the three papers Mary read, John read more papers.'
(Oda 2008: 89)

Appendix

Outside of Comparatives

(6) Ken-wa yooroppa-yori amerika-ni iku-koto-ni kimeta. Ken-TOP. Europe-STD America-to go-fact-DAT. decided 'Ken decided to go to Europe rather than America.' (Beck et al. 2004: 295)

Multiple Context Setters

(7) John-wa Mary-ga yonda yori Bill-ga yonda yori Sue-ga John-TOP. Mary-NOM. read STD Bill-NOM. read STD Sue-NOM. yonda yori nagai hon-o yonda. read STD long book-ACC. read 'John read a longer book than any of Mary, Bill and Sue did.' (Oda 2008: 146)

1.2 English

Variation in Acceptability

- (8) a. ?/??/*Compared to what John bought, Mary bought a longer umbrella.
 - b. Mary bought a longer umbrella than John (did).
- (9) a. Compared to what John bought, Mary bought more umbrellas.
 - b. Mary bought more umbrellas than John (did).

Variation in Interpretation

- (10) <u>Context</u>: A clothing store has reduced prices for a number of items. A certain dress got less of a reduction than some coat, although the absolute price for the coat is still above the price for the dress.
- (11) a. Compared to the dress, the coat is less expensive.
 - b. #The coat is less expensive than the dress (is).

Island Sensitivity

- (12) a. Compared to Bill, John wrote a paper that was longer.
 - b. #John wrote a paper that was longer than Bill.

Filled Degree Argument Slot

- (13) a. Compared to the five papers Mary wrote, Bill wrote more papers.
 - b. *Bill wrote more papers than Mary wrote five.

1.3 German

Variation in Acceptability

- (14) a. ?/??/*Im Vergleich zu was Johannes gekauft hat, hat Maria in.the comparison to what John bought has has Mary einen längeren Regenschirm gekauft.
 - a longer umbrella bought
 - 'Compared to what John bought, Mary bought a longer umbrella.'
 - b. Maria hat einen längeren Regenschirm gekauft als Johannes Mary has a longer umbrella bought STD John (gekauft hat).

bought has

'Mary bought a longer umbrella than John.'

(15) a. *Im Vergleich zu was Johannes gekauft hat, hat Maria mehr* in the comparison to what John bought has has Mary more *Regenschirme gekauft.*

umbrellas bought

'Compared to what John bought, Mary bought more umbrellas.'

b. Maria hat mehr Regenschirme gekauft als Johannes (gekauft hat). Mary has more umbrellas bought STD John bought has 'Mary bought more umbrellas than John.'

Variation in Interpretation

- (16) <u>Context</u>: A clothing store has reduced prices for a number of items. A certain dress got less of a reduction than some coat, although the absolute price for the coat is still above the price for the dress.
- (17) a. [?]Im Vergleich zu dem Kleid ist der Mantel weniger teuer. in.the comparison to the dress is the coat less expensive 'Compared to the dress, the coat is less expensive.'
 - b. #Der Mantel ist weniger teuer als das Kleid. the coat is less expensive STD the dress 'The coat is less expensive than the dress.'

Island Sensitivity

- (18) a. Im Vergleich zu Ulrike war James auf einer Insel im in.the comparison to Ulrike was James on an island in.the Pazifik, welche größer war. pacific which bigger was 'Compared to Ulrike, James visited an island in the Pacific which was bigger.'
 - b. #James war auf einer Insel im Pazifik, welche größer war als James was on an island in.the pacific which bigger was STD Ulrike.

Ulrike

'James visited an island in the Pacific which was bigger than Ulrike.'

Filled Degree Argument Slot

- (19) a. Im Vergleich zu den fünf Büchern, welche Johannes gelesen in.the comparison to the five books which John read hat, habe ich mehr (Bücher) gelesen.

 has have I more books read 'Compared to the five books John read, I read more.'
 - b. *Johannes hat mehr Bücher gelesen als ich fünf.

 John has more books read STD I five

 'John read more books than I did five.'

1.4 Sāmoan

Variation in Interpretation

- (20) <u>Context</u>: Angenommen die Preise für Tarowurzeln und Kakao sind wegen einer schlechten Ernte ziemlich in die Höhe gegangen. Der Preisanstieg bei Tarowurzeln war um 1 Tala, bei Kakao nur um 30 Sene. (Aber trotzdem ist Taro immer noch billiger zu kaufen als Kakao.)¹
- (21) 'O le talo e taugatā atu i lō le koko.

 TOP. the taro TAP expensive DIR. PREP. STD the cocoa 'Compared to cocoa, taro is more expensive.'

^{1 &}lt;u>Translation</u>: Assume prices for taro roots and for cocoa did go up considerably due to a bad harvest. The price for taro went up by one tala, the price for cocoa by thirty sene. Nevertheless, it's still cheaper to buy taro than to buy cocoa.

Island Sensitivity

- [?]Na fa'atau e Malia talo e tetele atu i lō Eseta.

 TAP buy ERG. Mary taro TAP be.many(pl.) DIR. PREP. STD Eseta

 'Compared to Eseta, Mary bought more taro.'
- (23) <u>Context</u>: Suppose that Mary bought five umbrellas while Frank only bought two umbrellas.
- (24) Sa fa'atau e Malia fa'amalu e tele i lō Falani.

 TAP buy ERG. Mary umbrella TAP be.many PREP. STD Frank
 'Compared to Frank, Mary bought more umbrellas.'

 (Villalta 2007: 6)

2 Compositionally Integrated Standards

	Predicative Comparative	Attributive Comparative	Adverbial Comparative	Clausal Standards	Scope: Bhatt & Takahashi (to app.)	Scope: Minimal Requirement Readings	Conclusion
Greek [GEN.]	Yes.	[In situ.]	No.	No.	-not elicited-	-not elicited- *)	[[-er _(Kennedy)]]
English [than]	Yes.	[In situ.]	No.	No.	(No.)	(No.)	[[-er _(Kennedy)]]
Greek [apo]	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	-not elicited-	-not elicited-*)	[[-er _(Heim)]]
Hindi	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	Wide.	Yes.	[[-er _(Heim)]]
Turkish	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	-not elicited-	Yes.	[[-er _(Heim)]]
German [als]	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Narrow.	Yes.	[[-er _(clausal)]]
English [than]	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Narrow.	Yes.	[[-er _(clausal)]]
Greek [apo'ti]	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-not elicited-	-not elicited-*)	[[-er _(clausal)]]

^{*)} However, Merchant (2011) provides other data that seem to require a scopally mobile operator and that point towards a scopally immobile operator in the case of the Genitive-marked comparative in Greek and speak in favor of a scopally mobile operator for apo- and apo iti-marked comparatives. Cf. the appendix.

Figure 2 Contextual Degree Comparatives

2.1 Immobile Comparative Operators

2.1.1 Greek

Predicative Comparatives

(25) Ke meta su lene pos i andres ine dhithen eksipnoteri and then you(DAT.) they say that the men are supposedly smarter ton jinekon!
of.the women
'And then they tell you how men are supposedly smarter than women!'
(Merchant 2011: 4)

Appendix

Attributive Comparatives

- (26) I Anna pandreftike enan psilotero tis andra. the Anna married(3sg.) a taller her(GEN.) man 'Anna_i married a man taller than her_i.'

 (Merchant 2011: 3)
- (27) O Kostas ine enas psiloteros tis andras. the Kostas is a taller of.her man 'Kostas is a man who is taller than she is.'
 (Merchant 2011: 15)

Adverbial Comparatives

(28) *I Maria pezi kithara kalitera mu. the Mary plays guitar better me(GEN.) 'Maria plays guitar better than I do.' (Merchant 2011: 4)

Scopal Mobility

(29) Thelo na ime psiloteros tis.

I.want SUBJUNCT. I.am taller of.her
= 'I want to be taller than she is.'
≠ 'I want to be taller than she wants to be tall.'
(Merchant 2011: 16-17)

2.1.2 Yorùbá

Attributive Comparatives

- (30) Context: You are comparing Olu's appearance to his father's.
- (31) *Olu je okunrin sisanra ju Baba re lo.
 Olu be man be.fat exceed father his STD
 'Olu is a fatter man than his father.'
 (Howell 2012: 34)

2.2 Versatile Phrasal Comparative Operators

2.2.1 Greek

Predicative Comparatives

(32) Kanenas den ine psiloteros apo ton eafto tu. person(neg.) not is taller from the self his 'Nobody is taller than himself.'
(Merchant 2009: 138)

Attributive Comparatives

(33) O Giannis exi perisotera periodika apo mena. the Giannis has more magazines from me 'Giannis has more magazines than I have.'

(Merchant 2011: 4)

Adverbial Comparatives

(34) *I Maria pezi kithara kalitera apo ton Gianni*. the Maria(NOM.) plays guitar better from the Gianni(ACC.) 'Maria plays the guitar better than Giannis.' (Merchant 2009: 136)

Clausal Standards

(35) *Perisoteri anthropi menun stis IPA apo sti Rosia.
more people live in.the United States from in.the Russia
'More people live in the United States than in Russia.'
(Merchant 2009: 139)

Scopal Mobility

(36) Thelo na ime psiloteros apo aftin.

I.want SUBJUNCT. I.am taller(masc.) from her

= 'I want to be taller than she is.'

= 'I want to be taller than she wants to be tall.'

(Merchant 2011: 18)

2.2.2 Hindi

Predicative Comparatives

(37) Sangeeta Ramesh se lambi hai.
Sangeeta Ramesh STD tall(fem.) is
'Sangeeta is taller than Ramesh.'
(Beck, Krasikova, Fleischer, Gergel, Hofstetter, Savelsberg, Vanderelst & Villalta 2009: 40)

Attributive Comparatives

(38) Sangeeta kepaas Ramesh se zyaadaa tez kar hai. Sangeeta POSS. Ramesh STD more fast car is 'Sangeeta has a faster car than Ramesh.'
(Beck et al. 2009: 40)

Adverbial Comparatives

(39) Sangeeta ne Ramesh se zyaadaa tez dauri.
Sangeeta ERG. Ramesh STD. more fast ran
'Sangeeta ran faster than Ramesh.'
(Beck et al. 2009: 40)

Clausal Standards

(40) *Aaj maine socha tha se zyaadaa garam hai.

Today I think was STD more hot is

'Today was hotter than I thought.'

(Beck et al. 2009: 41)

Scope: Bhatt & Takahashi (to app.)

(41) Har syn. paper har sem. paper-se zyaadaa logõ-ne paṛh-aa.
every syn. paper every sem. paper-STD more people-ERG. read-PERF.
'Every syntax paper was read by more students than every semantics paper.'
= 'The least read syntax paper was read by more people than any semantics paper.'
≠ 'There are more people who read every syntax paper than there are people who read every semantics paper.'
(Bhatt & Takahashi to app.: 19)

Minimal Requirement Readings

- (42) <u>Context</u>: The minimal requirement for the length of the paper is 25 pages. The draft is 20 pages long.
- (43) Ise theak 5 page aur lamba honā chahiye. it exactly five pages more long(masc.)
 'It is exactly five pages longer than that.'
 (Beck et al. 2009: 42)

2.2.3 Turkish

Predicative Comparatives

(44) Maria Peter'den uzun.

Mary Peter(ABL.) tall
'Mary is taller than Peter.'

(Hofstetter 2009: 193)

Attributive Comparatives

(45) Maria Hans'tan (daha) pahali bir araba satın aldı. Mary Hans(ABL.) even expensive a car bought 'Mary bought a more expensive car than Hans.' (Beck et al. 2009: 59)

Adverbial Comparatives

(46) Maria Peter'den hızlı koştu.

Maria Peter(ABL.) fast ran(3sg.)

'Maria ran faster than Peter.'

(Hofstetter 2009: 193)

Clausal Standards

(47) *Maria Hans sesli ıslık çalmadı sesli şarkı soöyledi.

Maria Hans loud whistled(3sg.) loud sing(past)(3sg.)

'Mary sang louder than Hans whisteled.'

(Hofstetter 2009: 194)

Minimal Requirement Readings

- (48) Müsvedde on sayfa uzunlu-ğun-da. draft ten page length-GEN.-in 'The draft is ten pages in length.'
- (49) Makale müsvedde-den tam beş sayfa uzun olmak zorunda. article draft-ABL. exactly five page long be.required 'The article is required to be exactly five pages longer than the draft.' (Hofstetter 2012: 324)

2.3 Clausal Comparative Operators

2.3.1 German

Predicative Comparatives

(50) Maria ist größer als das Bett lang ist.

Maria is taller STD the bed long is 'Maria is taller than the bed is long'

Attributive Comparatives

Sigrid hat eine schönere Rose in ihrem Garten als ich auf meinem Sigrid has a more.beautiful rose in her garden STD I on my Balkon.
 balcony
 'Sigrid has a more beautiful rose in her garden than I have on my balcony.'

Adverbial Comparatives

(52) Maria ist schneller gerannt als Bill.

Mary is faster run STD Bill

'Mary ran faster than Bill.'

Clausal Standards

(53) Meine Morning Glory ist heute größer als sie gestern war. my Morning Glory is today taller than she yesterday was 'My Morning Glory is taller today than it was yesterday.'

Scope: Bhatt & Takahashi (to app.)

(54) Mehr Menschen haben jedes Syntaxpapier als jedes Semantikpapier more people have every syntax.paper than every semantics.paper gelesen.

read

- 'More people read every syntax paper than every semantics paper.'
- = 'There are more people who read every syntax paper than there are people who read every semantics paper.'
- \neq 'The least read syntax paper was read by more people than any semantics paper.'

Scope: Minimal Requirement Readings

- (55) <u>Context:</u> The height minimally required of Johannes is below the height minimally required of Bill.
- Johannes muss weniger groß als Wilhelm sein.
 Johannes needs less tall than Wilhelm be 'Johannes needs to be less tall than Bill.'

2.3.2 English

Predicative Comparatives

(57) *My Morning Glory is taller today than it was yesterday.*

Attributive Comparatives

- (58) a. *Mary bought a faster computer than Bill.*
 - b. Mary bought a faster computer than this one.

Adverbial Comparatives

(59) *Mary ran faster than John.*

Clausal Standards

(60) The knife is longer than the drawer is deep.

Scope: Bhatt & Takahashi (to app.)

- (61) More people read every syntax paper than every semantics paper.
 - = 'There are more people who read every syntax paper than there are people who read every semantics paper.'
 - \neq 'The least read syntax paper was read by more people than any semantics paper.'

Minimal Requirement Readings

- (62) <u>Context</u>: The height minimally required of John is below the height minimally required of Bill.
- (63) *John needs to be less tall than Bill.*

2.3.3 Greek

Predicative Comparatives

(64) To oti o pritanis prokite na kalesi tin katharistria ine perisotero the that the dean is going to invite the cleaner is more aksioperiergo ap'oti tin Maria.

noteworthy STD the Maria(ACC.)

'That the dean is going to invite the cleaning lady is more noteworthy than that he is going to invite Mary.'

(Merchant 2009: 143)

Attributive Comparatives

(65) Perisoteri anthropi nomizan oti psifisan ton Gore ap'oti ton more people thought that they.voted.for the Gore(ACC.) STD the Bush.

Bush(ACC.)

'More people thought that they voted for Gore than though they voted for Bush.'

(Merchant 2009: 138-139)

Adverbial Comparatives

(66) I Maria milai me ton Petro pjo sixna ap'oti me ton the Maria(NOM.) speaks with the Petro(ACC.) more often than with the Gianni milai.

Giannis(ACC.) speaks

'Maria talks with Petros more often than with Giannis.'

(Merchant 2009: 141)

Clausal Standards

(67) I Maria pezi kithara kalitera ap'oti pezi kithara o the Mary(NOM.) play guitar better STD play guitar the Giannis.

Giannis(NOM.)

'Mary plays the guitar better than Giannis plays the guitar.'

(Merchant 2009: 135)

References

- Beck, Sigrid, Svetlana Krasikova, Daniel Fleischer, Remus Gergel, Stefan Hofstetter, Christiane Savelsberg, John Vanderelst & Elisabeth Villalta. 2009. Crosslinguistic variation in comparison constructions. *Linguistic Variation Yearbook* 9. 1–66.
- Beck, Sigrid, Toshiko Oda & Koji Sugisaki. 2004. Parametric variation in the semantics of comparison: Japanese versus English. *Journal of East Asian Linguistics* 13. 289–344.
- Bhatt, Rajesh & Shoichi Takahashi. to app. Reduced and unreduced phrasal comparatives. *Natural Language and Linguistic Theory*.
- Hofstetter, Stefan. 2009. Comparison in Turkish: A rediscovery of the phrasal comparatives. In *Sinn und Bedeutung (SuB) 13*, 191–205.
- Hofstetter, Stefan. 2012. Phrasal comparison in Turkish: Associating individuals with implicit degrees. In Elizabeth Bogal-Allbritten (ed.), Semantics of Underrepresented Languages of the Americas (SULA) 6, 319–334.
- Howell, Anna. 2012. *Comparatives and scope in Yoruba*. Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen M.A. thesis.
- Merchant, Jason. 2009. Phrasal and clausal comparatives in Greek and the abstractness of syntax. *Journal of Greek Linguistics* 9. 134–164.

Appendix

Merchant, Jason. 2011. Genitives of comparison in Greek. Manuscript, University of Chicago.

Oda, Toshiko. 2008. *Degree constructions in Japanese*: University of Connecticut dissertation.

Villalta, Elisabeth. 2007. Fragebogen zu Komparativen im Samoan. Handout, Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen.

Sigrid Beck and Vera Hohaus Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen Englisches Seminar Wilhelmstraße 50 72074 Tübingen (Germany) sigrid.beck@uni-tuebingen.de vera.hohaus@uni-tuebingen.de

Sonja Tiemann Eberhard Karls Universität Tübingen Sonderforschungsbereich 833 Nauklerstraße 35 72074 Tübingen (Germany) sonja.tiemann@uni-tuebingen.de