



Religious Encounters

Coexistence – Dialogue – Conflict

International & Interdisciplinary Conference

Jerusalem · Dormition Abbey

18–20 June 2019

Research Training Group 1662
“Religious Knowledge in Pre-Modern Europe (800-1800)”



Tuesday, 18 June 2019

Medieval Archaeology

Svenja Dalacker, Tübingen (Ger)

Concealed in the House. Manifestations of Religious Beliefs in Housing Contexts of the Middle Ages and Early Modern Times

Residential buildings can serve as a depository for different archaeological finds and features. Such finds can come to light during archaeological excavations, building researches and renovations. They show a wide range of materials which got into the house incidentally by dropping or forgetting them. In other situations, objects were placed intentionally, for example as depositons in the basement, in shrinkage cracks of the walls or in the space between two floors etc.

These finds are hitherto little-noticed and represent an underestimated source group of Medieval Archaeology and Historical Building Researches. Until now, research has primarily focused on construction elements of medieval and early modern houses. The aspect of houses as a social and cultural construct has been neglected thus far.

Concealed finds can give information on the residents and their religious everyday life as well as on the beliefs of the inhabitants and their religious practices. The domestic sphere can, at least temporarily, be seen as venue for rituals and a place where different religious beliefs come together. There are archaeological records in which Christian elements encounter evidence of “superstitious” beliefs. The practices behind these archaeological features were performed by clerics as well as by laical specialists: In the Reformed Emmental region in Switzerland, for example, we can find Capuchin monks playing the role of ghost banners, especially due to the lack of relevant spiritual specialists.

Thus, residential houses are places of transfer of religious knowledge and places of religious encounters, but also nodes between officially institutionalized and lived faith.

Harald Stadler, Innsbruck (Ger)

Are the Archaeologically Proven Handicrafts, Found Above the Surface in Buildings, Places of Religious Encounters? Tyrolean Case Studies from the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Age.

Since the intermediate floor findings in Castle Tyrol in 1994 the findings above the sward have become a major point of interest of the Department of Medieval and Mod-

ern Age Archaeology of Innsbruck University. After the publication of the above-mentioned findings the specialist colleagues of West Austria also became aware of the existence of these finding groups. This was followed by an abundance of evidence which was discovered in buildings of differing social quality, such as castles, churches, townhouses, and farmhouses. These findings range from the 13th to the 20th century, and they gave birth to various academic works which dealt with popular religion.

For the assessment of the archaeological records, a distinction between mono-deposits and mass deposits has to be made. In this talk, mass deposits in gore fillings of castles and monasteries are not taken into account. This talk deals with mono-deposits in buildings which, according to oral and written sources, can be attributed to handicrafts. Whereby every single record has to be examined individually, such as the shoe put in the intermediate floor or the glass bottle walled in a fireplace or the sewing accessories deposited in a cavity under the window sill or a half filled wine bottle placed in the anti-capillary barrier before placing the floor screed or a kinked playing card which was deposited under the floor board before placing the last board. The aim of this talk is to find out the various backgrounds of these customs, and to what extent religious believes were important to those who put the votive offerings into the buildings.

Art History

Ute Verstegen, Erlangen (Ger)

Many Religions in One Room. How Can We Systemize Historical Scenarios of Multi-Religious and Multi-Denominational Use of Spaces?

Religious conflicts have a high political relevance. In an increasingly globalized world, modern societies face the challenge of complicated negotiation processes between religious communities with different traditions, claims and power interests in one region. Terrorist attacks on religious buildings, destructive acts towards the cultural heritage of other religious communities and the formulation of monopolistic claims on specific holy sites are phenomena of corresponding processes. Jerusalem, in particular, is home to a multitude of places, such as the Temple Mount or David's Tomb, that are attributed to religious traditions by two or even three monotheistic religions and thus prime examples of interreligious conflicts.

A glance back in history shows that this was not always the case. In each social and political situation, different solutions were found to organize negotiation processes be-

tween religious communities. The paper aims to highlight a range of examples in which several religious communities shared or had to share built or urban spaces for quite different reasons. This could lead to convergences, overlays, separations, and also to collisions. Jerusalem will be the starting point of the paper, but in a broad perspective, scenarios from different geographic regions from late antiquity to early modern times will be taken into consideration. For instance, places of worship of holy persons, where several religions came together, or of multi-denominational use for services such as churches shared by two congregations ('Simultankirchen'), processions in the urban space or in spaces deliberately designed for the use by several religious communities. Against the background of recent challenges, the paper will systematize how the different demands were translated in terms of architecture, media, ritual and legal aspects. Moreover, different ideas regarding the visual communication of religious knowledge and the attitude towards the image in religious spaces will be analyzed.

Iris Palzer, Tübingen (Ger)

Rigour and Dialogue. Interdenominational Tendencies in Image and Architecture in the Diocese of Würzburg

When Julius Echter of Mespelbrunn took office as Prince-Bishop of Würzburg in 1571, the prince-bishopric was heavily in debt and many communities in the area of the diocese had converted to the Protestant faith.

Encouraged by the decisions of the Trent Council and with the help of constant visitations, an extensive building program and the reform of the rural clergy, "die alt Religion" (the old religion/ inscription panel from 1613 at the church in Prappach) was to be reestablished in the communities.

Sources and research prove a very rigorous behavior of Prince-Bishop Echter towards his Protestant subjects, especially in the rural communities. Forcing high-ranking and respected citizens to leave their homes if they would not give up their Protestant faith. The procedure was used to intimidate the other inhabitants and make an example. It was an effective approach: Although the services in the former Protestant communities, such as Iphofen and Münnerstadt, were well visited, there were only few communicants. Ultimately, a solution needed to be found to reintegrate these subjects into the "Old Catholic" community. Thus, instead of rigor, a dialog had to take place to convey the changes adequately, which the Catholic Church had made through the Trent reform. Image and architecture served as suitable media for this matter, since both not only

held a central position in the government program of Prince-Bishop Echter, but were also anchored in the resolutions of Trent.

The talk should elucidate on how an interdenominational dialog was evoked with the purposeful deployment of "religious knowledge" in image and architecture. The focus is on the use of a rather Protestant narrative in iconography and architecture, possibly to facilitate the assimilation of subjects and to create a dialog between the confessions.

Medieval German Literature

Alexandra Becker, Tübingen (Ger)

The Emir's Paradise. Encounter of Christian and Non-Christian Courtly Societies in Konrad Fleck's *Flore und Blanscheflur*

In pre-Christian times, the term 'paradise' already denoted a park or a garden, to which was added, in the Judeo-Christian tradition, the idea of an idyllic, beautiful place which God created for the first humans. The second Biblical creation narrative (Gen 2:4-3:24) describes paradise as a garden – the Garden of Eden – where the human being could enjoy a carefree existence, a life in harmony with animals and nature, and in proximity to God. After the Fall of Man, however, paradise was regarded as inaccessible for all time, and from then on became a place of longing, which sparked the belief in an earthly paradise as well as the hope of the eschatological paradise.

This idea also inspired literary-artistic productions and became a point of reference for the conception of ideal spaces. Middle High German literature describes many other paradises, artistically landscaped gardens as well as ideal natural landscapes which allude to or imitate the ideality of paradise, however, without ever achieving it.

This paper achieves to apply this perspective to Konrad Fleck's *Flore und Blanscheflur*. The story focusses the courtly love between Flore, son of a pagan king, and Blanscheflur, daughter of a Christian female slave. After Flore's parents tried to dissolve this inappropriate alliance, Flore goes on a quest to find his beloved, who he eventually finds in the orient in a tower of an emir. This distant place is framed by a delightful garden, which seems to be the earthly paradise itself.

Furthermore, the motif of the garden appears in many different ways and gives additional structure to the text. Each scene includes elements of paradise that function as the guiding concept of their design. Even though the motif is the most frequent in this Courtly romance the research has not focussed on this perspective yet.

Udo Friedrich, Cologne (Ger)

Myth – Topos – Metaphor. Intercultural and Social Functions of Paradise Gardens in Pre-Modern Texts.

This paper examines the complex range of functions of paradises by means of traditional theological paradise concepts, of historical itineraries from the times of the Crusades, of pseudo-historical projections, and of literary (courtly) conceptions of gardens. A key question here concerns the formation, positioning, and modification of cultural (as well as religious) differences via narratives (myths), arguments (topoi), and picture archives (metaphors). By reformulating the relation between narration and imagery with the help of the topos concept (topos as a real and imaginary place, topical knowledge, pictorial topics, topics as narrative argumentation), new perspectives on intercultural comparison emerge and can shed light on well-known material.

Keynote I

Gadi Algazi, Tel Aviv (Eng)

Kinship and Scholarship. New Configurations around 1500

As obligatory academic celibacy was eroding in Northern Europe at the end of the fifteenth century, German humanists began founding family households. This implied a major break in their way of life – the main focus of my work. The paper suggests, however, that viewing this change in a broader context and embedding family life in kinship structures can yield a more nuanced picture and bring to light channels of transmitting knowledge and learned dispositions running through kinship networks. They involve both (hardly visible) women and (all too visible) men, and link humanist Latin discourse with vernacular literacy and devotional practices. As we focus on several generations of families in urban communities of the Upper Rhine valley around 1500, unexpected kinship structures and invisible threads of traditions emerge.

Wednesday, 19 June 2019

Medieval History I

Jonathan Rubin, Ramat Gan (Eng)

Writing about the Religions of the Holy Land after 1291

As was revealed in recent years, among the Latin residents of the Crusader Kingdom of Jerusalem there developed a considerable degree of curiosity toward other religious groups, and several texts, such as Jacques de Vitry's *Historia orientalis* and Burchard of Mount Sion's *Descriptio Terre Sancte* attest to the process by which the Franks of the Levant were able to accumulate knowledge concerning both the Eastern Churches and Islam. While the Kingdom of Jerusalem ceased to exist in 1291, Latin writing in and about the Holy Land and its inhabitants did not come to a halt. Several seldom studied manuscripts attest to the composition and circulation of texts concerning the Holy Land in the Franciscan convent in Mount Sion during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. These manuscripts discuss various religious groups found in the Holy Land. In this paper I will present these texts and explore both the way in which they rely on sources from the Frankish period and the evidence they provide for the accumulation of 'new' information. I will also compare the attitude towards non-Latin groups characteristic of these Franciscan compilations to that which marked the Latin intellectuals of the Crusader period.

Christoph Mauntel, Tübingen (Eng)

Mapping Religion. Latin-Christian Perspectives on the Dissemination of Religious Communities

With the first eye-witness accounts of European travellers that had visited the Mongol courts and other distant areas of Asia, the knowledge of the world of Latin-Christianity was placed on a new basis. With this, certain ideas and questions were about to change: Many travellers commented on the religious beliefs of the people they visited and – even more eagerly – noted when they met Christian communities in the East. These groups were mainly adherents of Nestorianism, which led Latin-Christian authors to an ambivalent attitude: On the one hand, these people were at least Christians, but on the other hand, they did not respond to the Roman-Catholic Church.

The paper analyses what Latin-Christian authors knew about religious communities in a global perspective and the spread of Christianity in particular. Moreover, it scrutinises

how some authors dealt with the fact (they now became aware of) that Latin-Christianity was but a small minority of the world's population.

Early Modern History

Robert Mađarić-Beer, Tübingen (Eng)

The Fine Line Between Dialogue and Polemics. Jacob Judah Leon's Scholarship and the Jewish-Christian Relations in 17th-Century Amsterdam

In his lifetime, Jews and Christians alike considered Rabbi Jacob Judah Leon (1602-1665) to be a leading authority on the architecture and rites of the Jewish Sanctuary. The arguably most important fruit of his scholarship, his lost models of the Temple, Tabernacle, garments of the priests and Temple tools, earned him this reputation. The models were represented in various prints, as well as explained in the guidebooks to the models.

The main aim of this multimedia scholarship was to offer correct interpretation of commonly misinterpreted Biblical passages concerning the places of the ancient Jewish worship. Similar tendency towards the correct understanding and defence of the authority of the Holy Scripture pervade the rich literary output of 17th century Amsterdam Portuguese Jewish community. In practicing the Biblical scholarship in this way, Leon and other Jewish scholars helped to create and defend the re-established Jewish identity of their 'ex - New Christian' community in Amsterdam.

However, the output of Leon's scholarship, especially his 'real image' of the Temple and the Tabernacle in the Wilderness stood at the same time in the focus of different Christian groups coexisting in 17th century Amsterdam.

The present paper focusses on the ways in which Jacob Judah Leon's scholarship accommodates both the concern for the preservation of his own 'Portuguese nation' and the intense exchange with his Christian surrounding. Ranging from the intimate friendships and knowledge exchange to the debates and anti-Christian polemics, it exemplifies the complexity of the Jewish-Christian relations in 17th century Amsterdam.

Zur Shalev, Haifa (Eng)

Translations. Hottinger and *Yihus ha-Avot* (Genealogy of the Fathers)

The Swiss scholar Johann Heinrich Hottinger (1620–1667) is best known to us as an Orientalist and as the author of a monumental *Historia orientalis* (1651). In this presen-

tation I turn to his work as Hebraist, and in particular I take a closer look at one of his lesser known works, the *Cippi Hebraici* (Hebrew Tombstones, 1659, 1662). This is a Latin bi-lingual translation, with copious annotations, of a late medieval Hebrew text, *Yiḥus ha-Avot* (Genealogy of the Fathers). The Hebrew text, of which there are many versions, moves along a series of Jewish sacred sites, mostly tombs of biblical and rabbinical holy men, in Palestine in the nearing regions. The particular copy of the *Yiḥus* with which Hottinger worked had arrived in Europe (Venice probably) from Safed, Palestine in the late 16th century with a Polish-born Jewish messenger, Uri Ben Simeon of Biala. Uri, whose name appears on the richly illustrated manuscript. Hottinger, however, discovered the text in Frankfurt in 1658 during a diplomatic mission. In my presentation I explore the circumstances which brought this text (probably in manuscript scroll form) from Safed in the Galilee to Heidelberg, at the heart of Protestant Europe and into Hottinger's hands. By looking at this transition between religious and cultural spheres and at Hottinger's translation methods, linguistic, visual, cultural and polemical, I try to make sense of Hottinger's interest in the text/artefact. This case study is part of a larger project on the reception of Jewish and Hebrew geographical texts (e.g. itineraries, cosmographies) in the early modern European Republic of Letters. I propose to expand our understanding of Christian Hebraism in early modern Europe, a field which sees renewed interest in recent scholarship.

Medieval History II

Grigorii Borisov, Tübingen (Eng)

Thought Thrives on Conflict. Religious Coexistence in Legal Spaces on the North Frankish Frontier around 800

The second half of the 8th – begin of the 9th c. is predominantly called in the historiography “Saxon wars of Charlemagne” and considered as one of the first steps in the dissemination of Christian culture on the Central and Eastern Europe. Rural communities of *Frisia* and *Saxonia* between Lower Rhein and Elbe, which were included into the Frankish Realm at this time, differed from the society of the Carolingian empire a lot. There were differences in usage of the script, in the Christian and pagan religions, and last but not least in the political structure of these communities. This territory is being discussed in the paper as a frontier of the Frankish kingdom and its Christian mission,

which must have changed law and legal culture among the population of the Empire behind the Rhine.

In the paper I'm trying to apply the term legal space, debated during the last ten years in the medieval legal history as one of the main constructive principles of the legal order in heterogenic societies, for discussing the religious coexistence of Christians and pagans in this region during the end of the 8th – beginning of the 9th centuries. The combination of documental sources as Latin charters on the one side and archaeological sources on the other side let me retrace legal practices of the local population and contextualize the normative prescriptions of Frankish power in the conflict. The *leges* written down for these communities at 802 are therefore analyzed as a dialogue between Frankish authority and representatives of these communities.

Irina Variash, Moscow (Eng)

Legal Space and Medieval Interculturality

It is commonly agreed that oral forms remained basic for all traditional cultures and dominated in the area of social regulation. This feature was fully inherent to medieval law due to the predominance of customary law. To regulate relations between individuals or individuals and authorities meant in Medieval Europe to know, to use and to represent legal norms of a polity or a community – *consuetudines, usus, forum, customs*. The written right was considered as a legal form very special in its sense and social role. Medieval culture itself understood it and tried to fix in written form the norms of customs, however, this had no effect on the practical use of customary tradition.

However, it is less clear how can we know anything about oral legal tradition, this real and natural instrument of human communication if its voice has been lost in the past.

To study Medieval Law without evaluating the considerable part of cases, to describe medieval legal structures neglecting the oral rules and the horizon of legal feeling, would lead to distortion of factual picture. The described methodological problem becomes even more complex if we study a society in which the different religious groups were included, e.g. not only Christians, but also Jews and Muslims. The interaction among confessional communities, the links and the deals between people imparted to this society the modality of Interculturality.

The focal question of my paper is How can we study the Law of Muslims who lived under the Christians Rulers. There were active and day-to-day relations on the one hand, and almost total absence of sources from Muslim's communities, on the other. The new

concept of “Legal Space” is proposed here in order to open new horizons in our study of the Sharia within the Interculturality of the Latin World. The use of this concept reveals new anthropological and social dimensions in the legal history of Medieval Europe.

Keynote II

Tamar Herzig, Tel Aviv (Eng)

Christians, Jews, and Converts in Renaissance Italy

The phenomenon of religious conversion—the crossing of the very boundaries that define faith communities and differentiate them from one another—has attracted considerable attention from scholars of early modern history in the last few decades. Italian historians, in particular, have become increasingly aware of the importance of studying religious conversion for understanding key facets of premodern Europe and the Mediterranean, as the five special issues that leading Italian historical journals have devoted to the topic since 1996 make clear. One of these special issues [titled *Strategie e normative per la conversione degli ebrei dal Medioevo all’età contemporanea*, special issue of *Materia giudaica*, edited by Mauro Perani], published in 2014, is dedicated to a specific type of conversion: that of converting from Judaism to Christianity. In light of these recent advances in historical research, my paper will examine the specificity of Jewish conversion in Renaissance Italy, and argue that expounding the multiple transformations that characterized this kind of conversion are crucial for understanding Italian religiosity in this era.

The paper will delineate the main traits of Jewish conversion to Catholicism in fifteenth and sixteenth-century Italy, and show how they were shaped by the religious beliefs and practices at the core of both Judaism and Catholicism. Conversion from Judaism in Renaissance Italy, I maintain, differed from the conversion of other non-Christians to Catholicism in the Italian peninsula, as well as from the conversion of Jews to Christianity in other parts of Europe during this period. The paper will emphasize the need to explore the peculiar meanings that converts, their former coreligionists, and those who persuaded or compelled them to convert ascribed to the acts of boundary crossing. Finally, I will propose that these meanings were profoundly shaped by gendered presumptions.

Thursday, 20 June 2019

Theology

Sven Gröger, Tübingen (Eng)

Facing the Others. Anselm of Canterbury's (Inter)Religious Encounters in Italy in 1098

Anselm of Canterbury (1033–1109) was prior, later abbot of Bec in Normandy, before becoming archbishop of Canterbury in 1093. While in this position, he was driven into exile twice. Anselm spent the times of exile travelling around France and Italy. In 1098, during his first exile, he accompanied pope Urban II to Capua and Bari where he had different encounters with 'the others', i.e. people from another denominational, or even religious, background.

One of Anselm's most famous and influential works, *Cur deus homo*, deals with "the objections of unbelievers who reject the Christian faith [...], and the answers given by the faithful." When Anselm began the treatise in c. 1094 he was still in England. One of the reasons for his writing were objections of Jews to Christian doctrine. He had learned about these through an intense exchange with his former student Gilbert Crispin in 1092-3. When Anselm finally finished the work he was staying in the surroundings of Capua where he indeed came into personal contact with 'unbelievers': According to his biographer Eadmer, Anselm received anybody who wanted to speak to him, i.e. even the Muslim mercenaries taking part in the siege of Capua, since he was not making any differences with regard to social status or religion.

Shortly afterwards, Anselm was summoned by the pope to the Council of Bari to discuss with the Greeks about the doctrinal questions of the Great Schism of 1054. Anselm put down the arguments he used in this debate with 'the others' a little later in his treatise *De processione Spiritus sancti* (finished in 1102). He also addressed questions which arose from the same context in his *Epistola de sacrificio azimi et fermentati*.

The present paper focusses on Anselm's encounters with 'the others' during his time in Italy in 1098. It investigates their historical context, and analyses to what extent and in which way they left their mark on Anselm's thinking while facing 'the others'.

Maria Lissek, Bern (Eng)

Facing the Others. Gilbert Crispin's Controversial Dialogues Within Interreligious Encounters in the 12th Century

Gilbert Crispin (1046–1117) was a monk at Bec in Normandy. Later, he became abbot of Westminster in London where he held contacts of both personal and official nature with local Jewish inhabitants. In his controversial dialogues, *Disputatio iudaei et christiani* and *Disputatio christiani cum gentili de fide Christi*, he reflects on his real encounters with non-Christians, the so-called others, in a fictional way. In these works, the focus lies on the reflection of his Christian self-understanding considering Jewish and non-Christian objections to Christian faith.

In addition, at Bec, Gilbert was a student of Anselm of Canterbury and both became friends. They were still in contact when Gilbert became abbot of Westminster. Their friendship was characterised by an intellectual exchange about Christian faith. Therefore, the personal and intellectual relationship between them had influence on Gilbert's works, especially concerning the genre of controversial dialogues and the use of *ratio* within theological argumentation.

The present paper focuses on Gilbert's Christian self-understanding in facing 'the others' as presented in his controversial dialogues. It analyses to what extent and in which way interreligious encounters in the 12th century in England and the relationship with Anselm left their mark on Gilbert's thinking while facing 'the others'.

Philosophy

Stefan Leicht, Tübingen (Ger)

Maimonides and Grotius on Divine and Natural Law

In my lecture I want to focus on the relation between revealed or divine law and natural law. Concerning Maimonides, there is a consensus that natural law is not accepted by him in the usual understanding of the term or even at all. After having outlined the complex idea of law in Maimonides I want to shed some light on Grotius' attempt to inaugurate a scientific study of law and his idea of natural law. The sources show, that Grotius was familiar with Maimonides ideas on law, therefore the comparison of the two rationalists seems to be legitimate. I will illuminate among other questions the following ones: What is the function of revelation concerning the law? Is there a harmony among revealed and natural law? Does the (universal) natural or revealed law have an obligation for all people or is there no universal law – however rational it seems to be – ever pos-

sible? Why is there always a tension between the law and philosophy – and how is this tension solvable in the political realm?

Thomas Meyer, Munich (Ger)

About Leo Strauss's *The Literary Character of the 'Guide for the Perplexed'*. Contexts and Reception

Leo Strauss's book chapter *The Literary Character of the 'Guide for the Perplexed'* (originally published 1941, reprinted with changes in Strauss's *Persecution and the Art of Writing*, June 1952) is a classic and still a provocation. Many scholars consider the article as the beginning of a one-sided reading of Maimonides' "Guide" that produced a whole cotton-industry of interpretations in the exoteric/esoteric-style. Others appreciate the new reading by Strauss of the canonical text. The Lecture offers a close reading of Strauss's text and the unknown context of the writing and publication of this text – and also insides into the scholarly reception of the text. One focus will be the reading of the medieval sources by Strauss and how he "creates" his story.

Contact

University of Tübingen

Research Training Group 1662

"Religious Knowledge in Pre-Modern Europe (800-1800)"

Dr. Christoph Mauntel

Liebermeisterstraße 12 · 72076 Tübingen · Germany

Phone: +49 7071 29-77333

christoph.mauntel@uni-tuebingen.de

www.religioeses-wissen.uni-tuebingen.de

Abbreviations

(Ger): Paper given in German · (Eng): Paper given in English

Picture credits

Disputation between Christians and Jews, in: *Der Seelen Wurzgarten*, Augsburg, Johann Schönsperger 28.08. 1484, BSB-Ink S-243 -- GW M41162, fol. 18v.